

1/12/2018

ILO Discussion and Qualitative Data on Assessment

Participants: Michael Fragoso; Beth-Anne Mulder; Dinorah Castro; Malissa Buggs; Leah Elliott; Elisabeth Sundby; Helen Acosta; Jerry Ludeke; Faith Bradham; Nick Strobel; Suzanne Tangeman; Alex Gomez; Andrew Haney; Joe Saldivar; Ximena Da Silva; Maria Wright; Janet Fulks; Ericha Menchaca; Teresa McAllister; Janet Yakoub; Christina Lopez; Valerie Robinson; Keri Kennedy; Mark Osea; Regina Hukill; Patrick Serpa; Julie Lowe; Karimeh Amin; Yvonne Armendariz; Eleonora Hicks; Dana Heins-Gelder; James McGarrah; Jessica Woteysiak; Dianthe Hoffman; Billie Jo Rice; Craig Hayward; Karen Snow; Alma Livingston; David Buitron; Janet Fulks; Lori Ortiz

Renegade Room L217 12:30-2:00 301. Dessert and Discuss: How do we know our students are learning?- Di Hoffman, Janet Fulks, Billie Jo Rice



1/12/2018



Demographic information:

Employee type

<b>Employee role (Total 41)</b>	
Faculty	36
Classified	1
Administrators	4
<b>Time working at BC</b>	
Less than 2 years	8
2-5 years	11
6-9 years	1
10-19 years	6
Over 20 years	6

**Disciplines:** ACDV, Allied Health, Archives, Anthropology, Biology, Counseling, Communication, Culinary Arts, Industrial Technology (Auto), Human Services, Journalism, Library, Math, Nursing, Office of Institutional Effectiveness (OIE) Physical Science (Chemistry & Astronomy), Student Support, Sociology

**Campuses:** Online, Delano, Main Campus

1/12/2018

- I. Opening session led by Culinary Arts instructor, Suzanne. Assessment of two students' work and sharing of Judges criterion rubric/scoring sheet.

The meeting began with a CulinaryArts demonstration using 2 tables presenting the same dessert offerings for the group with the same resources available to each student. Two rubrics were shared with a analysis of the student performance and an expansion of the objectives within culinary arts (cooking) to the outcomes, prepared and tasty but presented will, sanitary and broadly providing nutritional benefits for all diets.

"We as consumers make assessments with our pocket book." SO looks are key outcomes.

\*\*Please reference picture of product "set-up" and Rubrics at end of report.

- II. Four ILOs:
  1. Critical Thinking
  2. Communication
  3. Engagement
  4. Subject-based knowledge

Review of close similarity to four of the six CSUB ILOs.

How many of you know the Institutional Learning Outcomes at BC? (Raise your hand – do a count) - Everyone

Where can you find these? (Strategic Directions; Program Review; Curriculum Documents; Assessment Committee)- Many responses

What are the Institutional Learning Outcomes at BC? (See if they can name them) Everyone got them

Have a look at the diagram with BC's ILOs and CSUBs ILOs – any observations? **Don't know, perhaps they are closely related.**

What advantage does it provide our students that these align with CSUB? **Yes!**

How do you assess these ILOs in your courses or programs? How do you know your students have "learned" these and can do something to demonstrate it?

Comprehensive assessment:

- III. Survey work
  - a. Librarian (Faith Bradham) (Please reference report on Renegade Scorecard)
    1. Fall 2017 Survey of students regarding the degree to which the Library had helped them fulfill each ILO
    2. Library – full assessment of library services – mixed methods design – sent out several surveys to students and faculty as well – Library does not have PLOs, thus the need for assessing ILOs
    3. Q1: Table of ILOs Does the library help you meet those ILOs using a 5 point scale
    4. 40% of respondents strongly agreed 0%in strongly disagreed
    5. Overall 75% either agreed or strongly agreed
  - b. Academic Support Services (Director -Maria Wright) (Please reference report on Renegade Scorecard & Program review website)
    1. 172 tutors in the Success Center

1/12/2018

2. Formative evaluation of student workers and the degree to which work study students were advancing in ILO
3. ~90%+ at least somewhat agree that student work study job increased their ILO competency - communication skills, engagement, and critical thinking skills. Follow up questions based upon the ILOs in the various CAS domains got specific responses on these general ILO themes.
4. Results: field of knowledge 88% agreed; 87% new skills tied to academic field of knowledge; 79% improved communication skills; 99.5% campus employment has helped them to engage with peers, faculty, and staff; 87% job has helped them to develop critical thinking skills in their job
5. Study is posted on program review website (Fall 2016)

#### IV. Group sharing

1. What in your class captures/assesses critical thinking?
  - a. Communication/Speech (Helen Acosta )
    1. Impromptu speeches based on sayings or clichés
    2. Four minutes to prepare for a four-minute speech
    3. Short speech and preparation time are training that allows students to build databases in their brains
  - b. Reading; Academic Development (Theresa McAllister) ACDV B50 and ACDV B60
    1. Critical thinking in a reading class tied to research in the library and a common controversial subject
    2. Increases awareness of important topics such as vaccinations
    3. This assignment assess all ILOs
  - c. Chemistry (Ximena Da Silva) STEM major Chemistry
    1. Ten or eleven different labs
    2. Give an unknown salt and they have to figure out what it is based upon semester long lab activities
    3. Not a clear step-by-step directions scenario – each student must devise their own problem solving process; they often make mistakes and this is where they learn that mistakes are part of the learning and thinking process. This activity teaches to persevere through the content and work independently on testing various lab activities
    4. Also hits ILO #2 (communication) students write ten-page report - organize and present data
  - d. Automotive (Andrew Haney) “I am not here to TEACH you but to FACILITATE your learning.”
    - i. I response to Advisory Board comment – students don’t know how to use voltmeter
    - ii. Faculty now requires voltmeter competency to pass class
    - iii. Sometimes he’ll say or write something wrong just to see if the students pick up the error
    - iv. Demonstrate learning of skills on an actual car
    - v. Did get dinged by students on his “Mode A” evaluation because he does not always provide a straightforward lecture. But he feels he will continue to try this method and evaluate benefit.
    - vi. This method also evaluated Demonstration of specific skills and knowledge as well as engagement in the course.
  - e. Math (Regina Hukill)
    1. Noticed that the last section of every assignment based upon application problems was not going well via SLO assessment
    2. By including the application problems throughout the class, student performance improved greatly

1/12/2018

- f. Biology (Joe Saldivar) Several Project examples
1. Imparting the grey areas of science
  2. The life of Henrietta Lacks (cervical cancer cells that are living on) but they were taken from her without consent and the Lacks family has not received any payment
  3. Ethics
  4. Give me your opinion and provide an argument on why you feel how you do about Henrietta Lacks
- g. Anthropology (Dana Heins-Gelder)
1. How do you know what you know?
  2. Shares article on Florida gov. saying that there is no money for social sciences in college
  3. Assignment: construct a rationale for the value of SS. Outcomes include: Understanding of theoretical perspective. Providing evidence for claims that they are making. Developing critical rationale for their ideas. Ultimately linking evidence to support all their statements whether pro or con to the legislature.
  4. Or share articles on gender, race etc. and critically evaluate the applications
- h. Communication (Christina Lopez)
1. Media literacy
  2. Understand media bias
  3. Understand when being targeted by online ads
  4. Group paper assignment in teams and present verbally
  5. Come as strangers, leave as engaged friends
- i. Sociology (Eleonora Hicks)
1. This project is aligned as a course SLO and with degree PLO and with ILOs
  2. Apply main Sociological Theories to a popular movie. Students must link theory to behavior or social interaction or constructs within a film. For instance, identifying dysfunction or bias or constructive collaborations in a modern film.
  3. Have students analyze movies or tidbits of music
    4. Use a theoretical perspective to frame and analyze a movie
    5. Must use evidence
      1. Quotes
      2. Describe body language
  6. Also assesses ILO Demonstrate by engaging students with theoretical perspectives in Sociology as depicted in everyday life and art.

Summary: Critical Thinking Assessments are often also assessing the other ILOs as well. Generally Critical Thinking Assessments included:

- An unknown situation that culminates the previous learning (e.g. an unknown to analyze, a case study, a bugged car, etc)
- A spontaneous assignment where students think on their feet (spontaneous speech, essay, dialog)
- Argument or Debate over an opinion or conclusion
- Testing thoughts or content for accuracy
- Peer evaluation with high level summative criteria or capstone work
- Activity associated with real life events or issues and application of theory



1/12/2018

## 2. What in your class captures/assesses the communication (oral and/or written) ILO?

- a. ACDV B72 (Michael Fragoso)
  - i. Mathematical language – translating math into English
  - ii. Write the steps out in English
  - iii. For examples – for each step in a proportion they may do the math and then write “Moved variables to the other side of the equation”
  - iv. Student break down instructions and work to develop a narrative to their problem-solving.
  
- b. Nursing (Beth Anne Mulder)
  - i. Team-activity
  - ii. Students make reports from Day shift/Night shift for ongoing care simulating a busy floor and turnover
  - iii. Additional distractions such as - Call buttons going off every few minutes, need to adapt to changes and co-workers calling in sick
  - iv. This really tests accuracy and facility in communicating among team members during hand-off between shifts
  
- c. Microbiology (Janet Fulks)
  - i. Using Helen Acosta’s communication rubric adapted for subject specificity; students do oral reports of case studies with a ppt presentation. There are 3 different case studies throughout the semester and teams must collaborate to solve and report on the case
  - ii. This work culminates in a final project where students do an oral and written report but the written report takes the form of a professional pamphlet or a 3 dimensional model.
  
- d. Communication specifically Intercultural communication (Helen Acosta)
  - i. Teaching Positive Regard
  - ii. Very hard to do in Bakersfield comparative stats show comparatively low scores for our students at BC
  - iii. Her students do well on all other Communication benchmarks until they get to positive regard – Students tend to assume very negative things about people they don’t know
  - iv. Potential insight that because Bakersfield is the butt of jokes in the media, in California etc., students are raised with their own negative attitude about themselves and this spills over to others (relative deprivation?)
  - v. This multi-staged assessment with pre and post testing as well as intermediate assignments assesses critical thinking and engagement as well as communication
  
- e. Reading & Writing (Jessica Wojtysiak)
  - i. Debate coach approach to make students argue
  - ii. Reading: challenged book/banned book assignment
    1. One person works on theme
    2. One on characters
    3. One about why the book was banned/challenged
  - iii. Assignment: argue with the school or community board concerning why the book should/should not be banned
  - iv. This assessment ties readings to the “real-world” or contextualized learning and evaluation of a previously banned or challenged book

1/12/2018

- f. Nursing (Leah Elliot) \*\*see assignment sample, pictures etc. At assessment website
  - i. Students participate in a teaching faire where they orally communicate with patients in a simulated bedside situation.
  - ii. The assignment was to present a teaching project in a realistic manner just like you would to an expectant or new mother. No power points allowed as this is not realistic for the bedside. An alternative (creative) project was to create a rendition of a fetus in utero and to label the parts. Students are encouraged to use found objects or items from home rather than purchasing materials. I have found that by giving this assignment with a minimum of instruction, the students go above and beyond in their creativity.
  - iii. This not only assesses oral communication but also critical thinking and demonstration of knowledge specific to the major area.

Summary: Communication Assessments are often also assessing the other ILOs as well. Generally Assessments included:

- Oral reporting
- Translating ideas into writing
- Teamwork and communication
- Role Play
- Pre and Post-testing

### 3. How are we captures/assessing the Engagement ILO?

- i. Encourage volunteering within the field (Nursing, Human Resources, Biology, Sociology)
  - ii. Sociology has students get signatures from a variety of school offices and supports such as Supplemental Instruction, Math Lab etc. (Eleonora Hicks)
  - iii. Some have students explore website and identify a club that they would like to join
  - iv. Paula Parks' club for African American students – meet with mentors once per month
  - v. Di Hoffman – nursing program encourages volunteers like Vision Van - BC 3<sup>rd</sup> semester RN students volunteered alongside Advanced Center for Eyecare, OneSight, CSUB Nursing Students, Panama Buena Vista, Bakersfield City, Delano, South Kern, Wasco, Greenfield, Lost Hills, McFarland and Standard School Districts to give the gift of sight to over 1400 children. During this clinic, pre-screened children received free vision care including full vision exams and new eyewear. Students participated in all aspects of vision screening and were able to assist these children in improving their vision. What a great privilege and learning experience it was for our students to serve children in our community with volunteers from around the world.
  - vi. Filed Trips -Joe Saldivar – 80% of students have never seen the ocean. Joe conducts a variety of field trips to both immerse students in their world and link demonstrated skills in the field of study (Biology)Field trips engage students and the community and are remembered
- V. Faculty were asked to send assessment tools and artifacts so that they can be made available on the assessment site
- VI. FINAL Thoughts
1. Institution-wide Critical Thinking Follow-up
  - b. The group reviewed the previous 2014 Critical Thinking Institution-wide Assessment model, results and outcomes. The assessment committee determined that this assessment should be repeated and requested volunteers repeat the critical thinking ILO assessment in February/March 2018.

1/12/2018

- c. Found that critical thinking levels tended to be higher among students in higher level/more advanced classes
- d. Disaggregated results were used to justify the expansion of SI to General Education, not just Basic Skills , courses

2. Future Plans for ILO Assessment

- a. The new Elumen plans will link course assessments to program and ILO results.
- b. With Guided Pathways implementation, more emphasis will be made on the capstone coursework along pathways whether they are courses or projects culminating a program.
- c. Graduation surveys are also being considered.

Below are the sample rubrics used by Culinary Arts to explain that it is far more than just cooking, students must present well, make good decisions on nutrition and choice and critically think about many professional aspects of their learning that reflects real life. The Culinary Arts department set up to sample tables of student desserts and described how they critique using oral and written feedback. See two sample presentations and the rubrics below.

Team # \_\_\_\_\_ Student's name \_\_\_\_\_

Judges Criterion - Score 1-5 (5 the best)

**Mise en Place and Dessert Display**

	Score	Comments
Sanitation		
Variety of menu		
Presentation of the desserts		
Use of Ingredients		
Portion Size		
Creativity of Display		
Flavor		
Total		

**Entrée Course with Salad**

	Score	Comments
Sanitation		
Fabrication		
Presentation		
Use of Ingredients		
Portion Size		
Creativity		
Flavor		
Total		

**Chef's choice or Entrée Chicken and Carrots**

	Score	Comments
Sanitation		
Fabrication		
Presentation		
Use of Ingredients		
Portion Size		
Creativity		

FDSV B55C Lab Evaluation: Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Student Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Assignment \_\_\_\_\_

Criteria	Max Points	Grade Points
Mise en Place/Organization	10	
Sanitation/Cleanliness	5	
Proper Utilization of Product	15	
Timing	15	
Presentation	10	
Flavor, Balance and Doneness	20	
Cooking Techniques/consistency	25	
Total Possible	100	

**Comments:**



1/12/2018

