CURRICULUM COMMITTEE REVIEW OF DISTANCE LEARNING COURSES AND SECTIONS

Academic Senate for California Community Colleges

NOVEMBER 1995

Curriculum Committee 1994-1995

Bill Scroggins - Chabot College, Chair
Patrick Cain - Citrus College
Craig Justice - Chaffey College
Eileen Knight-White - Fresno City College
Ric Matthews, San Diego Miramar College
Janet Megill - Mira Costa College
Bill Norlund - Los Angeles Pierce College, CIO Representative
Bobbi Paul - San Diego CCD

Table of Contents

ntroduction	1
dentifying Distance Learning Courses and Sections	
Separate Review and Approval	2
Class Size	3
easibility	4
Personal and Regular Instructor-Student Contact	4
Annual Report to the Board of Trustees	4
Program Review	5
Precesses for Accomplishing Distance Learning Reviews	5
Policy Implications for Academic Senates	5
Summary	6
Conclusion	6
Distance Education Review and Approval Checklist	7
Regulations and Guidelines on Distance Education	

Curriculum Committee Review of Distance Learning Courses & Sections

The Academic Senate for California Community Colleges

Introduction

In the 1970s the growing popularity of college courses broadcast over the public air waves led to the addition of regulatory language permitting the offering of such **telecourses** by the California Community Colleges. The offerings were limited to transferrable credit courses, and, largely due to concerns by faculty in both the California Community Colleges and the University of California, required regular, personal instructor-student contact. Class size was limited to 125 students.

The technological advances of the 1990s have added new tools for the instruction of students both in an out of the classroom. Many colleges have taken advantage of such diverse learning strategies as computer assisted instruction, real-time two-way interactive video, multimedia presentations, electronic bulletin boards, and e-mail. In 1994 the regulations were again amended to expand the range of allowed instruction. (See Appendix A.) Use of communication technology for instruction of students who are physically separated from their instructor is now permitted for all credit and non-credit community college courses.

The requirements for offering courses or sections of courses in **distance learning mode** were changed substantively. These changes included such key components as class size, instructor-student contact, and methods for apportionment. As part of the process of monitoring the impact of these changes, the regulations require local curriculum committees to separately review and approve courses and sections taught in distance learning mode. Guidelines were also established which include data collection and an annual report to the local board of trustees. (Appendix A contains both the regulations and the guidelines.) The purpose of this paper is to recommend to local curriculum committees the basis upon which their review and approval might be accomplished.

Identifying Distance Learning Courses and Sections

Colleges must be able to identify which of their existing courses--and also those new courses which are being planned--fall under the new regulations and so must be separately reviewed and approved. First, many instructors use communication technology to enhance student learning <u>outside</u> of class. An English instructor may require students to go to the learning resource center outside of class time to use computer facilities for researching sources for a term paper. Or the math faculty may set up a learning lab in which students can drop by on their own time to use computer-assisted instructional programs to strengthen their problem solving skills. Because these activities take place outside of regular class time, they do not constitute distance learning as governed by the regulations. This out-of-class factor must be

taken into consideration when identifying distance education sections and courses following the definition in Title 5 section 55370, "distance education means instruction in which the instructor and student are separated by distance and interact through the assistance of communication technology." Courses and sections of courses may be **identified as distance education** whenever instruction is being provided through the assistance of communication technology, the student is out of line of sight of the instructor, and **the instructional hours are claimed for apportionment and counted as credit hours for units awarded to the student for successful completion of the class.** The apportionment for distance education is discussed in sections 55370 and 58003.1 of Title 5 included in Appendix A. The regulation covering credit hours and their relationship to units earned ("Carnegie units") is section 55002.5.

Separate Review and Approval

Section 55378 of Title 5 requires that courses "delivered by distance education shall be separately reviewed and approved according to the district's certified course approval procedures." Such review and approval is to be done by the college curriculum committee (55002), is to use the same standards of course quality as applied to traditional classroom courses (55372), and is to be made with the full involvement of the faculty through the collegial consultation process (55374).

The impact of this regulatory change is that curriculum committees need to develop a local process to review and approve distance learning courses. Note, however, that while the review and approval process may be separate, the quality standards are the same as for courses taught traditionally. It is not the course standards which vary but the mode of instruction. Thus, if the same course content is taught both in lecture and distance learning modes, only one course outline is needed. An American history class which has definite objectives and content stated in the course outline is the same course whether those objectives are achieved in traditional lecture mode or by distance learning. However, if the objectives and content of the distance learning presentation are significantly different from the lecture-based material, the two are separate courses. **Curriculum committees must decide in their review if the delivery by distance learning has significantly changed course objectives and content.** If so, the distance learning approach constitutes a separate course with a unique course outline.

Note that while the objectives and content should be the same for either mode, other features of the course may vary. The methods of presentation, assignments, evaluation of student performance, and instructional materials may be significantly different. Title 5 Section 55002 requires that the course outline provide types or examples of these components. For a single course taught in both modes, these sections of the course outline should list types or examples of both the lecture and distance learning methods and materials. For those taught solely in distance learning mode, these sections should be complete enough for thorough review. Curriculum committees must make a judgement as to the quality of the course

based on a review of the appropriateness of the methods of presentation, assignments, evaluation of student performance, and instructional materials. Are these components adequate to achieve the stated objectives of the course? If not, the presentation of the course in distance learning format should not be approved. It may be that adjustments to the course objectives are needed or that supplementary materials are required to ensure adequate coverage for the distance learning material.

The changes in the regulations removed the "line-of-sight" requirement for instruction when using communication technology. This opens up the instructional methodology far beyond use of telecourses. Techniques such as computer assisted instruction and multimedia presentations provide instruction by computer-student interaction which may not be directly mediated by an instructor who is physically present. These new approaches are instructional methodologies which must be included in the course outline of record and separately approved for their quality and appropriateness by the curriculum committee.

Class Size

Section 55352 states that the "number of students assigned to any one course section offered by distance education shall be determined by and be consistent with other district procedures related to faculty assignment." Such procedures "may include a review by the curriculum committee..." These procedures cannot "impinge upon or detract from any negotiations or negotiated agreements between exclusive representatives and district governing boards."

This section acknowledges the dual impact of class size determinations. The number of students in a section affects workload <u>and</u> instructional quality and appropriateness. Teaching 200 is much more work than teaching 35. The instructional methodologies for effectively teaching the same material at the same level of comprehension are much different for a class of 200 than for 35. The role of the curriculum committee here is definitely that of <u>quality assurance</u>. Curriculum committees may, if approved by college practices, review the appropriateness of the instructional methodology of a course for the stated class size. Such a practice must follow the district's certified course approval procedures (section 55378) and cannot conflict with the bargaining agreement (section 55352).

On some campuses, curriculum committees are currently involved in class size determinations. The more common practice, however, is for class size to be determined on a course-by-course basis through negotiations with the exclusive bargaining agent. The expanded regulations which have now removed the 125 student class size limit may impact the bargaining agreement. If class sizes are increased, it may be in the best interests of the institution as a whole to have the curriculum committee review the course for effectiveness in providing instruction to this larger number of students. If the curriculum committee is to provide this review, it must not in any way impinge on the right of the bargaining agent to negotiate appropriate faculty workloads.

Feasibility

One of the criteria in the *Curriculum Standards Handbook*, Section 3.4, is the feasibility of offering courses within an approved degree or certificate program. Courses offered in distance learning mode often require the use of state-of-the art equipment which represents a considerable fiscal investment by the district. It is expected that outlines of record presented to the curriculum committee for approval represent courses for which adequate instructional equipment, materials, and training are available to make offering of the course feasible.

Personal and Regular Instructor-Student Contact

For transferrable credit courses, Title 5 Section 55376 continues to require "regular personal contact between instructor and students, through group or individual meetings, orientation and review sessions, supplemental seminar or study sessions, field trips, library workshops, or other in person activities. Personal contact may be supplemented by telephone contact and correspondence." For non-transferrable credit and non-credit courses, "regular contact" is required. Regular contact is to be consistent with the guidelines which state, however, that "districts will need to define 'regular contact,' including how often and in what manner instructor-student interaction is achieved." In documenting local definitions of regular contact the guidelines require "the inclusion of information in applicable outlines of record on the type and frequency of interaction appropriate to each distance education course or section."

Most logically, the course outline section on methods of instruction would give the type and frequency of instructor-student contact. For transferrable courses this contact must be personal, that is, face-to-face, not even including two-way interactive video. For non-transferrable courses this contact must be in accord with the district's definition of regular contact.

Because of this close tie with the course outline, it is reasonable to suggest that curriculum committees be involved in developing the district's definition of regular contact. Then, when reviewing the course outline, the committee would be able to ascertain if the specified methods of instruction for the distance education delivery is in line with that definition.

Annual Report to the Board of Trustees

Title 5 Section 55317 requires that colleges Aprovide to the local governing board...annually...a report on distance education activity...consistent with reporting guidelines....@ The guidelines which accompany the regulations ask a series of specific questions in the areas of purpose, student access, faculty, quality, costs, and recommendations. (See the appendix.) The curriculum committee should be involved in developing this annual report to the board, particularly in addressing questions about the type and quality of student-faculty interaction (including providing the board with the definition of Aregular contact@), instructional support, and effectiveness of courseware.

Program Review

The expansion of distance education may involve revisiting the college=s program review process. Particular attention should be paid to the effectiveness of distance education courses in basic skills and non-credit areas. In its primary role of curriculum review, the curriculum committee will play a central role in this revision of the program review process. The questions in the annual report to the board, as mention above, would serve as a starting point for this discussion.

Processes for Accomplishing Distance Learning Reviews

Distance learning courses and sections do not usually constitute a large portion of the college's offerings. As a result, the technical aspects of the review might best be accomplished by a small subcommittee of the curriculum committee. This would enable a group of faculty to become well informed as to the standards, to assist faculty in meeting those standards as they develop course outlines, and to do a preliminary technical review before the course is brought to the full curriculum committee for review and approval.

Policy Implications for Academic Senates

This paper reviews specific implementation requirements for the approval of distance education courses and sections by curriculum committees following local practices. Beyond these particular nuts-and-bolts procedures, local academic senates should consider the broader policy implications of expansion of distance education offerings. The development of educational programs, of which distance education is one, are the responsibility of academic senates through shared governance. Planning and budgeting processes, upon which the expansion of distance education will have a great impact, are also shared governance issues. The academic senate is empowered to shape the development of the college curriculum through its governance role. As colleges seek to plan, budget, and develop programs using distance education, the academic senate should assert its primary role in the development and implementation of these policies and procedures.

Summary

The standards as reviewed above are:

- 1. All or part of the sections of the course are to be taught by distance education as indicated by all of the following:
 - Some or all of the hours of instruction are provided by communication technology without the instructor within line-of-sight of the students as specified in Title 5

- Section 55370.
- b. Such hours are claimed for apportionment pursuant to Title 5 Section 58003.1.
- c. Such hours serve as the basis for awarding student units as defined in Title 5 Section 55002.5.
- 2. The objectives and content of the course are adequately covered as specified in methods of instruction, assignments, evaluation of student outcomes, and instructional materials, pursuant to Title 5 Sections 55372 and 55002.
- 3. If taught in traditional as well as distance learning mode, both achieve the stated objectives and content.
- 4. The distance learning methodology is effective for the specified class size, subject to the restrictions in Title 5 Section 55352.
- 5. Instructional equipment, materials, and training are sufficient to make the offering of the course or section feasible following the Curriculum Standards Handbook Section 3.4.
- 6. For transferrable courses, personal contact is specified, and, for non-transferrable courses, regular contact, both type and frequency, is specified in agreement with the district definition and Title 5 Section 55376.
- 7. Evaluation methods are in place to produce an annual report to the board on activity in offering this course or section following the guidelines to Title 5 Section 55317 and to review the impact of distance education on this program through the program review process specified in accreditation standard 2B.2.

These standards appear in check-list format on the next page.

Conclusion

Distance learning certainly has had and will continue to have a major impact on the curriculum of the California Community Colleges. By systematic and thorough review, districts can assure that the high academic standards which typify their course offerings will be maintained for those taught by distance education.

Distance Education Review and Approval Checklist

□ 1.	 All or part of the sections of the course are to be taught by distance education as indicated by all of the following: 			
		instruction are provided by communication or within line-of-sight of the students as specified		
	□ b. Such hours are claimed for app	ortionment pursuant to Title 5 Section 58003.1.		
	□ c. Such hours serve as the basis Section 55002.5.	for awarding student units as defined in Title 5		
2.	•	ourse are adequately covered as specified in valuation of student outcomes, and instructional 55372 and 55002.		
□ 3.	If taught in both traditional and dista objectives and content.	nce learning modes, both achieve the stated		
□ 4.	The distance learning methodology is the restrictions in Title 5 Section 5535	effective for the specified class size subject to 2.		
5.	• •	training are sufficient to make the offering of the Curriculum Standards Handbook Section 3.4.		
6.	 For transferrable courses, personal contact is specified, and, for non-transferrable courses, regular contact, both type and frequency, is specified in agreement with the district definition and Title 5 Section 55376. 			
7.	offering this course or section following	duce an annual report to the board on activity in g the guidelines to Title 5 Section 55317 and to on on this program through the program review ndard 2B.2.		
Appro	vals:			
(Signe	ed) Faculty Discipline Originator	(Signed) Faculty Curriculum Chair		
(Signed) Faculty Senate President		(Signed) Chief Instructional Officer		

Regulations and Guidelines on Distance Education

Overview

This document sets forth the Chancellor's implementation guidelines required by the regulations adopted by the Board of Governors in March of 1994. These regulations expand district authority to design and implement distance education across the curriculum. District implementation of distance education courses pursuant to these regulations shall be consistent with these implementing guidelines.

The regulations establish a trial period through the year 2000 during which districts will be required: (a.) to provide a narrative report annually on distance education activities to their governing boards with a copy made available to the Chancellor's Office, (b.) to report data on distance education activities through full compliance with Management Information System (MIS) reporting requirements, and (c.) to respond as required by the Technical Advisory Committee established by the regulations. Any new course designed to use distance education technologies during this trial period will be subject to the same local and state approval standards and procedures that are currently applicable to all other forms of instructional delivery.

Accompanying each regulation (where applicable) is a guideline which explains and clarifies the implementation of the associated regulation. The guidelines were developed by a task force of diverse constituent groups originally convened by the Chancellor to build a common foundation for Board action. A roster of task force members and statement of principles used throughout its deliberations is attached as an appendix to this document.

The guidelines can and will be revised by the Chancellor as deemed necessary, upon the advice from a Technical Advisory Committee established according to the Board of Governors' Standing Order 409.

It is important to note that district observance of the guidelines will play an important part in the community college system's review and evaluation of distance education activities at the end of the trial period and any subsequent revisions of these regulations.

55316. Criteria.

Courses offered pursuant to this Chapter shall:

- (a) Be accepted by the college toward completion of an appropriate educational sequence leading to an associate degree, and
- (b) Be recognized by an institution of the University of California or the California State University upon transfer to that institution.

NOTE; Authority cited: Sections 66700, and 70901, Education Code. Reference: Sections 70901, 70902, and 78310, Education Code.

2 Distance Education

55316.5. Additional Courses.

Notwithstanding any other provision of law, after June 1, 1994, the following additional types of courses may be offered pursuant to this Chapter, consistent with guidelines developed by the Chancellor:

- (a) Nontransferable courses designed to meet the requirements of Sections 55805.5, 55806, and 55002(a) or (b);
 - (b) Noncredit courses conducted as distance education independent study.

This Section shall become inoperative on July 1, 2000, unless a later-adopted regulation deletes or extends this date.

NOTE; Authority cited: Sections 66700, and 70901, Education Code. Reference: Sections 70901.70902. and 78310. Education Code.

Guideline for Sections 55316 and 55316.5

These sections extend the variety of courses that may be delivered through distance education. Since 1981, districts have had authority to offer transferable, degree credit courses in which the instructor and student are separated by distance and interact through the assistance of communication technology. Now districts may offer nontransferable non-degree-credit and noncredit distance education courses.

The authority to provide nontransferable distance education is scheduled to end on July 1, 2000, or may be extended and modified. Districts are being given this period of time to explore how best to utilize new educational delivery modalities and to test whether such innovations are successful.

55317. Ongoing Responsibilities of Districts.

Any district conducting courses under Section 55316 or 55316.5 shall:

- (a) Maintain records and report data through the Chancellor's Office Management Information System on the number of students and faculty participating in new courses or sections of established courses:
- (b) Provide to the local governing board no later than July 1, 1995, and annually thereafter, a report on all distance education activity.
- (c) Provide other information consistent with reporting guidelines which shall be developed by the Chancellor pursuant to Section 409 of the Procedures and Standing Orders of the Board of Governors.

This Section shall become inoperative on July 1, 2000, unless a later-adopted regulation deletes or extends this date.

NOTE: Authority cited: Sections 66700, and 70901, Education Code. Reference: Sections 70901,70902, and 78310, Education Code.

Guideline for Section 55317

Districts that continue existing distance education offerings or begin new ones during this trial period will be required to report regularly all management information system (MIS) elements to the Chancellor's Office Management Information System Division. To fulfill this MIS reporting requirement, districts will need to assure that data, now regularly reported within data element XF01 on each session's method of instruction, do reliably differentiate distance education non-distance education activities. Session-Instruction-Method is currently under review and will be revised to accomplish this differentiation and to better reflect the types of distance education instructional methods currently taking place. Until data element XF01 is revised, districts offering distance education courses should report MIS data with the existing instructional method codes using "30," "50," or "80" for sessions employing distance education instructional methods.

Section 55317 also requires districts to report annually all distance education activity to their local governing board and to make a copy available to the Chancellor's Office for evaluation during the trial period. In order for the local evaluations to be useful to the Board of Governors in their review of trial results, it is desirable that districts provide documentation of the evidence used in preparing their local reports and to the extent possible that they compare and contrast distance education to traditional instructional delivery.

The annual report to the local governing board should, to the extent possible, address the following questions:

P	urpose
	What was the intent in offering the course by distance education?
	How was learning enhanced by the use of technology?
S	tudent Access
	What is the evidence, if any, that the new methodology increased the number of students
	served, or extended services to new populations?
	What student services were provided to support student success for distance education?
	In what ways were the goals of the district's Student Equity Plan furthered?
	What is the evidence, if any, that special community needs were met by the courses using new methodologies?
F	aculty
	How were faculty selected to teach each distance education section and what relevant professional development activities and support services were provided to them?
	What was their perception of the experience, as expressed by instructors and student

Quality

noneffective?

☐ How did student satisfaction compare with that in courses offered in a traditional mode?

services professionals? Which new approaches were judged effective? Which were judged

Distance Education 4 ☐ In what ways was student achievement improved? □ Did students with prior independent study experience do better in distance education than those without prior experience? □ What type and quantity of student-faculty interaction occurred in each course? □ What types of instructional support and student services were provided to ☐ How appropriate and effective was the courseware for each course? ☐ Was equipment satisfactory for each course? □ Which technological mix was used most effectively? □ What differences, if any, were there in the level of student achievement in transferable verses nontransferable distance education courses? Costs ☐ How did start-up costs for distance education compare with other modes of instruction? ☐ How did continuing costs for distance education compare with other modes of instruction? □ In what ways, if any, does faculty and staff load differ for distance education sections? Recommendations

Other

□ Based on input from the Technical Advisory Committee referenced in the Board of Governors' Standing Order 409, the Chancellor may require districts to provide additional information.

□ What suggestions can be made for the improvement of distance education?

55340. Eligibility for State Funds.

In order for attendance in a course of independent study to be eligible for state apportionment pursuant to the provisions of this Chapter, the course must be reported as required by this Chapter, and meet all other requirements of statute and regulation relative to eligibility for state apportionment.

NOTE: Authority cited: Sections 66700, and 70901, Education Code.

Reference: Sections 70901, 70902. and 78310. Education Code

55352. Number of Students.

The number of students assigned to any one course section offered by distance education shall be determined by and be consistent with other district procedures related to faculty assignment. Procedures for determining the number of students assigned to a course section offered by distance education may include a review by the curriculum committee established pursuant to Section 55002(a)(1).

Nothing in this section shall be construed to impinge upon or detract from any negotiations or negotiated agreements between exclusive representatives and district governing boards. **NOTE:** Authority cited: Sections 66700, and 70901, Education Code. Reference: Sections 70901, 70902, and 78310. Education Code.

Guideline for Section 55352

As rewritten, this section no longer includes a limitation on the number of students per instructor that could be instructed using distance education modalities. However, it is not intended that the act of removing this limitation in any other way should affect existing local practices used to determine the number of students assigned to any distance education course section. That determination should continue to be guided by informed judgment as to what class size best contributes to educational quality, student equity objectives, and reasonable faculty workload.

This section is not more specific in defining the number of students that may be enrolled in distance education sections, because there is considerable variability throughout the system in the process used to determine appropriate c/ass size under specified local circumstances, including possible provisions in local collective bargaining agreements.

Article 2. Distance Education.

55370. Definition and Application.

Distance education means instruction in which the instructor and student are separated by distance and interact through the assistance of communication technology.

All distance education is independent study, and subject to the general requirements of Article 1 as well as the specific requirements of this Article. Provided however, that fully interactive distance education courses, as defined in guidelines adopted by the Chancellor, shall not be considered independent study for purposes of calculating state apportionment pursuant to Section 58003.1. In addition, instruction provided as distance education is subject to the requirements that may be imposed by the Americans with Disabilities Act (42 U.S.C. Sec. 12100 et seq).

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 70901, Education Code. Reference: Sections 70901-70902. Education Code.

Guideline for Section 55370

As rewritten, this section no longer includes a definition of telecourses nor a listing of specific types of electronic technology that might be employed to deliver education at a distance. These references were removed because they too narrowly defined existing or possible future activity in a rapidly evolving educational area.

The term "telecourse," often associated with lack of student access to a "live" instructor, has consistently been replaced in these regulations with more generic references to courses offered in a distance education modality.

All varieties of distance education except the one defined below are considered independent

6 Distance Education

study for purposes of calculating applicable state apportionment pursuant to Section 58003.1. This means that in practically every instance the district's claim is based upon the units of credit awarded to students enrolled in distance education courses rather than upon the number of hours spent attending course sessions and completing homework. The exception noted in this section is referred to as "fully interactive" distance education. Distance education shall be considered fully interactive when the technology employed provides an immediate (real time) opportunity for exchange between participants. Fully interactive distance education can be reimbursed by state apportionment based upon the district's regular student attendance c/aim as provided for in Section 58051 (a)(1).

Districts should make themselves aware of the requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act as they apply to students engaged in distance education.

55372. Course Quality Standards.

The same standards of course quality shall be applied to distance education as are applied to traditional classroom courses, in regard to the course quality judgments made pursuant to the requirements of Section 55002 of this Part, and in regard to any local course quality determination or review process.

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 70901, Education Code. Reference: Section 70901-70902, Education Code.

55374. Course Quality Determinations.

Determinations and judgments about the quality of distance education, under the course quality standards referred to in Section 55372, shall be made with the full involvement of faculty in accordance with the provisions of Subchapter 2 (commencing with Section 53200) of Chapter 2 of Division 4 of this Part.

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 70901, Education Code. Reference: Section 70901-70902, Education Code.

Guideline for Sections 55372 and 55374

These two sections emphasize the extent to which course quality depends upon the full involvement of faculty in distance education design and application. The only text change from earlier regulatory language has been to rep/ace the term "telecourse" with "distance education." See Subchapter 2 (commencing with Section 53200) of Chapter 2 of Division 4 of this Part for a fuller statement of the faculty's role.

55376. Instructor Contact.

In addition to the requirements of Section 55002 and any locally-established requirements applicable to all courses, district governing boards shall ensure that:

(a) Each section of a credit transferable course which is delivered as distance education shall include regular personal contact between instructor and students, through group or

individual meetings, orientation and review sessions, supplemental seminar or study sessions, field trips, library workshops, or other in person activities. Personal contact may be supplemented by telephone contact and correspondence.

(b) All other approved courses offered by distance education shall include regular contact between instructors and students consistent with guidelines issued by the Chancellor pursuant to Section 409 of the Procedures and Standing Orders of the Board of Governors.

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 70901, Education Code. Reference: Section 70901-70902. Education Code.

Guideline for Section 55376

This section defines what contact must be maintained between instructor and student depending upon whether the distance education course is transferable or not.

Subsection (a) stresses the historical obligation for the instructor of record in a transferable distance education course to have regular personal contact with enrolled students. The use of the term "regular personal contact" in this context suggests that students should have a frequent opportunity to ask questions and receive answers in-person from the instructor of record. Restatement of this obligation was encouraged by the University of California in order that the transferability of existing distance education courses might not be jeopardized.

Subsection (b) honors the principle that for newly authorized nontransferable distance education courses, there are a number of different kinds of acceptable interaction between instructor and student, not all of which may require in-person contact. Thus, during the trial period, districts will need to locally define "regular contact," including how often, and in what manner instructor student interaction is achieved. On the other hand, districts are not authorized to redefine "fully interactive" as found in the guideline to Section 55370.

It is important that districts document how regular contact is achieved as this information will bear upon the overall evaluation of distance education during the trial period as provided in the Board of Governors' Standing Order 409 and cross referenced in Section 55317(c). Documentation should consist of the inclusion of information in applicable outlines of record on the type and frequency of interaction appropriate to each distance education course or section. As indicated in the Guideline to Section 55317, districts need to describe the type and quantity of student-faculty interaction in their annual reports to their local governing boards.

55378. Separate Course Approval.

Each proposed or existing course, if delivered by distance education, shall be separately reviewed and approved according to the district's certified course approval procedures. NOTE: Authority cited: Section 70901, Education Code. Reference: Sections 7090170902, Education Code.

55380. Faculty Selection.

Instructors of sections delivered via distance education technology shall be selected by the same procedures used to determine all instructional assignments. Instructors shall possess the minimum qualifications for the discipline into which the course's subject matter most appropriately falls, in accordance with Article 2 of Chapter 4 of Division 4 of this Part (commencing with Section 53410), and with the list of disciplinary definitions and requirements adopted by the Board of Governors to implement that Article, as such list may be amended from time to time.

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 70901, Education Code. Reference: Sections 7090170902, Education Code.

Guideline for Sections 55378 and 55380

These two sections emphasize the need for districts to follow the same procedures for course approval and faculty selection in distance education courses and sections that apply in other delivery modes. The on/y text change from earlier regulatory language has been to replace the term "telecourse" with "distance education." See Article 2 of Chapter 4 of Division 4 of this Part (commencing with Section 53410) for a fuller statement of the faculty selection process. It is worth noting that many forms of distance education delivery require technical knowledge on the part of faculty.

58003.1. Average Daily Attendance; Computation.

- (a) Pursuant to the provisions of Section 58051, the units of average daily attendance for apportionment purposes shall be computed for courses based on the type of course, the way the course is scheduled, and the length of the course.
- (b) The governing board of each community college district shall, for each of its colleges or its district, select and establish a single primary term length for credit courses that are scheduled regularly with respect to the number of days of the week and the number of hours the course meets each week, inclusive of holidays. The units of average daily attendance of credit courses scheduled conterminously with the term, exclusive of independent study or work experience education courses, shall be computed by multiplying the average student contact hours of active enrollment as of Monday of the week nearest to one-fifth of the length of the term, unless other weeks are specified by the Chancellor to incorporate past practice, by the term length multiplier, multiplied by the statewide factor as established by the Board of Governors subject to the approval of the Department of Finance, and divided by 525. The term length multiplier for attendance accounting purposes shall be determined in accordance with regulations of the Board of Governors, provided that the maximum multiplier for semester length terms shall be 17.5 and the maximum multiplier for quarter length terms shall be 11.67.
- (c) For credit courses scheduled to meet for five or more days and scheduled regularly with respect to the number of hours during each scheduled day, but not scheduled co-terminusly with the college's primary term established pursuant to subdivision (b), or scheduled during the summer or other intersession, the units of average daily attendance, exclusive of independent study or work experience education courses, shall be computed by multiplying

the average daily student contact hours of active enrollment as of the census day nearest to one-fifth of the length of the course by the number of days the course is scheduled to meet, multiplied by the statewide factor as established by the Board of Governors subject to the approval of the Department of Finance, and divided by 525.

- (d) For credit courses scheduled to meet for fewer than five days, and all credit courses scheduled irregularly with respect to the number of days of the week and the number of hours the course meets on the scheduled days, the units of average daily attendance, exclusive of independent study or work experience education courses, shall be computed by dividing actual student contact hours of attendance by 525.
- (e) For all open entry-open exit credit courses and for all noncredit courses otherwise eligible for state aid, the units of average daily attendance shall be computed by dividing actual student contact hours of attendance by 525.
- (f) All independent study or work experience education courses are credit or noncredit courses.
- (1) For credit courses, for purposes of computing average daily attendance only, one weekly student contact hour shall be counted for each unit of credit for which a student is enrolled in one of those courses. The average daily attendance of those courses shall be computed by multiplying the average of the units of credit for which students are enrolled as of the census dates prescribed in Subdivisions (b) or (c), as appropriate for the primary term or intersession and duration for which the course is scheduled, by the term length multiplier as provided for in Subdivision (b), and dividing by 525.
- (2) For noncredit course sections conducted as distance education independent study, for purposes of computing average daily attendance only, weekly student contact hours shall be derived by counting the hours of instruction or programming received by the students, plus instructor contact as defined in Section 55376(b), plus outside-of-class work expected as noted in the course outline of record and approved by the curriculum committee, and dividing the total number of hours thus derived by 54. Hours of instruction or programming received shall be independently verified by the instructor using a method or procedure approved by the district according to policies adopted by the local governing board as required by Section 58030. Average daily attendance for such noncredit distance instruction independent study course sections shall be computed by multiplying: (A) the average of the number of students actively enrolled in the section as of each census date (those dates nearest to one-fifth and three-fifths of the length of the course section) by, (B) the weekly student contact hours as derived above in this Section, by (C) the primary term length multiplier of 17.5, and (D) dividing by 525. This Subdivision shall become inoperative on July 1, 2000, unless a later-adopted regulation deletes or extends this date.
- (g) Notwithstanding subdivisions (b) and (c) of this Section, the units of average daily attendance for any credit course other than independent study or work experience education courses may, at the option of the district, be computed by dividing the actual student contact hours of attendance by 525. When a district chooses to exercise the option of computing attendance for any course section by the actual student contact hours method, such method must be used consistently for all attendance accounting for that section.

NOTE: Authority cited: Sections 66700 and 70901, Education Code. Reference: Section

70901, Education Code.

Guideline for Section 58003.1

In order for noncredit distance education to be reimbursed from state apportionment, the historical noncredit funding mechanism that was based upon the classroom attendance of students had to be modified to accommodate the fact that not all distance education activity would be occurring in the classroom. That funding change is described in Subsection (f)(2); all other provisions of this Section remain unaltered.

Subsection (f)(2) defines how to compute weekly student contact hours for noncredit distance education. The factors that are aggregated in this calculation include:

the hours of in-person instructor contact,
the hours of instruction (not necessarily in-person) or programming received by students, and
the hours of outside-of-class work expected (as noted in the course outline of record).

58007. Noncredit Classes.

Contact hours of enrollment in noncredit courses shall be based upon the count of students present at each course meeting. Average daily attendance in noncredit courses shall be computed by dividing the sum of contact hours of enrollment by 525. Noncredit distance education courses described in Section 55370 shall be conducted as independent study, and the computation of average daily attendance shall be as prescribed in Section 58003.1(f)(2). **NOTE:** Authority cited: Sections 66700 and 70901, Education Code. Reference: Section 70901, Education Code.

Guideline for Section 58007

This section cross-references the new noncredit computation procedure described in Section 58003.1(f)(2) above.

58009. Application of Independent Study or Work Experience Attendance Procedure.

- (a) One weekly student contact hour shall be counted for each unit of credit for which the student is enrolled as of the census dates prescribed in Section 58003.1(b) or (c).
- (b) For credit courses average daily attendance in independent study or work experience education courses in primary terms is computed by multiplying the weekly student contact hours authorized pursuant to Subdivision (a) of this Section, generated as of the census date prescribed in Section 58003.1(b) by the term length multiplier as provided for in Section 58003.1, and dividing by 525.
- (c) For noncredit courses conducted as distance education independent study, average daily attendance is computed on a census basis as prescribed in Section 58003.1(f). This Subsection shall become inoperative on July 1, 2000, unless a later-adopted regulation deletes or extends this date.

(d) Average daily attendance in independent study or work experience education courses conducted during a summer or other intersession is computed by multiplying the weekly student contact hours, authorized pursuant to Subdivision (a) of this Section, generated in each course, by a course length multiplier that produces the same total weekly student contact hours for the same student effort as would be generated in such courses conducted in the primary terms, and dividing by 525.

NOTE: Authority cited: Sections 66700 and 70901, Education Code. Reference: Section 70901 Education Code

Guideline for Section 58009

This section established a sunset to the new noncredit computation procedure described in Section 58003.1(f)(2) above. Thus, no noncredit distance education will be eligible for state apportionment after July 1, 2000, unless a later-adopted regulation deletes or extends this date.

58051. Method for Computing Average Daily Attendance.

- (a)(1) Except as otherwise provided, in computing the average daily attendance of a community college district, there shall be included only the attendance of students while engaged in educational activities required of students and under the immediate supervision and control of an academic employee of the district authorized to render service in the capacity and during the period in which he or she served.
- (2) A community college district may also include the attendance of students enrolled in approved courses or programs of independent study, including courses or programs formerly conducted as coordinated instruction systems, who are under the supervision, control, and evaluation, but not necessarily in the immediate presence, of an academic employee of the district who is authorized to render such service. Such attendance may only be included for college level credit courses and programs which are accepted for completion of an appropriate educational sequence leading to an associate degree, and which generally are recognized upon transfer by institutions of the University of California or the California State University.

The community college district shall determine the nature, manner, and place of conducting any independent study course or program in accordance with rules and regulations adopted by the Board of Governors of the California Community Colleges to implement the purposes of this Subdivision. The rules and regulations shall require community college districts to ensure that the components of each individual study course or program for each student shall be set out in a written record or program, the number of units and hours of study required, the arrangements for consultation with the instructor, the work product to be evaluated, and the college facility required. The rules and regulations shall also provide for input from, and participation by, faculty, who are selected by academic senates or faculty councils, and students, in the development and evaluation of approved educational courses and programs.

(3) A community college district may also include the attendance of students enrolled in approved distance education independent study sections in accordance with the provisions of Section 55316.5(a) and (b).

12 Distance Education

- (b) For the purpose of work experience education programs in the community colleges meeting the standards of the California State Plan for Vocational Education, "immediate supervision" of off-campus work training stations means student participation in on-the-job training as outlined under a training agreement, coordinated by the community college district under a state-approved plan, wherein the employer and academic school personnel share the responsibility for on-the-job supervision. The student/instructor ratio in the work experience program shall not exceed 125 students per full-time equivalent academic coordinator.
- (c) For purposes of computing the average daily attendance of a community college district, attendance shall also include student attendance and participation in in-service training courses in the areas of police, fire, corrections, and other criminal justice system occupations that conform to all apportionment attendance and course of study requirements otherwise imposed by law, if the courses are fully open to the enrollment and participation of the public. However, prerequisites for the courses shall not be established or construed so as to prevent academically qualified persons not employed by agencies in the criminal justice system from enrolling in and attending the courses.
- (d) Notwithstanding Subdivision (c) and any regulations adopted pursuant thereto, a community college may give preference in enrollment to persons employed by, or serving in a voluntary capacity with, a fire protection or fire prevention agency in any course of in-service fire training at the community college in cooperation with any fire protection or fire prevention agency or association. Preference shall only be given when such persons could not otherwise complete the course within a reasonable time and when no other training program is reasonably available. At least 15 percent of the enrollment in in-service fire training courses shall consist of persons who are neither volunteers of, nor employed by, a fire protection or prevention agency or association, if the persons are available to attend a course. Average daily attendance for the courses shall be reported for state aid.
 - (e) Subdivision (d) shall apply only to the following:
- (1) Community colleges which, in cooperation with any fire protection or fire prevention agency or association, have been, as of January 1, 1980, the primary source of in-service training for any fire protection or fire prevention agency or association.
- (2) Community colleges which, in cooperation with any fire protection or fire prevention agency or association, establish in-service fire training for any fire protection or fire prevention agency or association which did not have in-service fire training prior to January 1, 1980.
- (f) in the event that certain in-service training courses are restricted to employees of police, fire, corrections, and other criminal justice agencies, attendance for the restricted courses shall not be reported for purposes of state apportionments. A community college district which restricts enrollment in in-service training courses may contract with any public agency to provide compensation for the cost of conducting such courses.
- (g) Positive records of student admissions and daily attendance in all in-service training courses in the areas of police, fire, corrections, and other criminal justice system occupations, as described in Subdivision (c), shall be maintained by each district and shall be separately reported annually to the Chancellor's Office.

NOTE: Authority cited: Sections 66700 and 70901, Education Code. Reference: Section 70901. Education Code.

Guideline for Section 58051

Subsection (a)(3) has been added to existing language to cross-reference the districts' new authority to offer nontransferable distance education as defined in Section 55316.5(a)and(b).

Standing Orders of the Board of Governors

409. Distance Education.

- (a) The Chancellor shall convene a task force comprised of members of those Consultation Councils most closely responsible for instruction to develop implementation guidelines, by June 1994, for offering distance education courses. Subsequent to the development of implementation guidelines, the Chancellor shall establish a Technical Advisory Committee on Distance Education to provide ongoing advice on the implementation and evaluation of distance education for the system.
- (b) The Chancellor shall, by December 1999, provide a report to the Board of Governors that evaluates distance education systemwide and provides data and analysis, by age, disability, ethnicity, and gender, on student access to student instruction, enrollment and completion rates, and student and faculty satisfaction.

Glossary

- **Communication Technology.** A system for sending and receiving voice, video and data electronic information.
- **Course Session.** Used in Management Information System reporting to indicate the separate records on a section of a course that distinguish when a part of the section is scheduled at a different time, on different days, in a different facility, or with several instruction methods.
- **Courseware.** Educational software and materials (such as programs) for a distance education course.
- **Distance Education.** Instruction in which the instructor and student are separated by distance and interact through the assistance of communication technology.
- **Fully Interactive.** A variety of distance education in which the technology employed provides an immediate opportunity for exchange between participants.
- **Independent Study.** A broad category of courses for which state reimbursement is based upon number of units of credit rather than amount of student attendance. For apportionment purposes, distance education is one variety of independent study.
- **Interaction.** A back-and-forth dialog, using communication technology, between the user and the system.
- **Real Time.** An electronic operation that is performed in the same time frame as its real-world counterpart. For example, real time video transmission produces a live broadcast

APPENDIX

Distance Education Task Force

Co-Chairs

Grace N. Mitchell Superintendent/President San Luis Obispo County CCD

Lee Haggerty Academic Senate Co-Chair Saddleback College

CEOCCC

Barbara A. Beno President Vista College

Lois A. Callahan Chancellor San Mateo County CCD

Marc E. Hall President Cosumnes River College

CIOCCC

Robert D. Allen Vice President, Instructional Services Victor Valley College

CSSOCCC

Wilma McLeod Vice President, Student Services Modesto Junior College

CSBG

Paulette Edwards
Student Body President
West Los Angeles College
Academic Senate

Regina Stanback-Stroud President, Statewide Academic Senate

Marty Hittleman Community College Council of the California Federation of Teachers

Jim Locke College of Marin

Leslyn Polk North Orange County CCD

Kathy Randolph-Sproles Community College Association/CTA

Bill Scroggins Chabot College

Paul Setziol DeAnza College

Staff

Lynn Miller Brenda Cun Chancellor's Office California Community Colleges

David Viar Community College League of California

16 Appendix

Distance Education Task Force Principles

- 1. Distance education, including the use of technologies to accomplish predetermined student outcomes, should be viewed as an appropriate means to achieve learning.
- 2. The state standards for funding, local processes used for development and approval, and outcome evaluation criteria of all distance education courses should be comparable to those used for other methods of achieving learning.
- 3. Interaction between student and faculty member is essential but may be accomplished in various ways. Various types of interaction should be addressed in the trial period.
- 4. The ability of the instructor to structure the learning environment is essential and should be addressed in criteria developed for the trail period.
- 5. No action regarding distance education should be taken at the state level which would jeopardize the transferability of courses to the University of California and the California State University.
- State funding for the expansion of distance education and technology-mediated education should be supplemental and not come from the limited funding available for present education programs and services.
- 7. All courses, whether offered by distance technology or not, should be funded at comparable levels.
- 8. Incentives and support should be provided for community college faculty training and development related to the potential and use of distance education and technology mediated education and to instructional design assistance.
- 9. There should be a trial period established when nontransferable credit and noncredit courses are permitted to be offered via distance education. During the trial period, any college which chooses to incorporate distance education and technology-mediated methodologies into nontransferable credit and noncredit courses must agree to meet established criteria that will be developed at the state level.
- 10. In order to meet the demands of the state, there is a need to develop a plan that encourages cooperation and eliminates unnecessary duplication.